VALUES AND ETHICS IN SECONDARY EDUCATION IN INDIA AND GERMANY: A CRITICAL COMPARATIVE ASSESSMENT

Mriganka Narayan Das

Assistant Professor, Department of Education,

Hiralal Mazumdar Memorial College for Women

Dakshineswar, Kolkata, West Bengal

INDIA

Email: mriganka1981@gmail.com

*PRELUDE***:**

In this 21st century, India and Germany are two important countries in respect of many dimensions especially in terms of education. In this present world, India is the largest democracy and also a developing country. On the other side, Germany is familiar as a well-developed economy and also having advanced infrastructure across several areas of its society. This study aimed to compare values and ethics in secondary education between India and Germany. It is mainly a qualitative study. The data were collected through different internet sources, different research papers, books and various official websites related to secondary education of India and Germany. The data were analyzed critically with logical approach considering various factors related to the values and ethics in secondary education. The study has revealed that in case of values and ethics in secondary education in India and Germany, there are much significant differences between these two countries although there exists some similarities. It is also revealed that there are critical issues on which India should give attention immediately in terms of values and ethical education for holistic development of the country's secondary education.

Keywords: Values, Ethics, Comparative, Secondary Education, India, Germany.

1.0 INTRODUCTION:

Values and Ethics together lay the foundation for sustainability of our progress individually as well as socially. Values and Ethics are so much important in every aspect of life. Values are the essential and stable faiths based on which a human being takes his or her own judgements in the journey of life. Both of these two abstract entities exist at the core of each human being's life which actually determines the standard of our behaviour. It severely affects the emotionally oriented mind of a human being. Values are such inner powers that indirectly influence a human being's behaviour in a specific way. It sets our priorities in life, i.e. what we consider in the first place (Surbhi, 2017). On the other side, ethics is mainly a part of moral beliefs of a person, a perception of logic about the action of whether it is right or wrong. Ethics is a state of our inner sense which identifies and compares between good or evil, fair or unfair and justified or unjustified issues about our moral responsibilities.

Values implies to the state of understanding or intrinsic beliefs for which a human being has a stable preference. On the other hand, e**thics** are the set of rules set up by certain group of people or by society that govern the behaviour of a human being (Surbhi, 2017). Education for imparting ethics and values in students covers a broad diversity of conceptual frameworks, different aspects, topics, and approaches. These are of key importance on all levels of educational process (Strahovnik, 2016).

In this present era, ethics and values have important place in all areas of life. Ethical sense of our behavior should be sited as a fundamental lesson in the educational system. In family, ethical education should focus on descriptive facts. It is a well known fact that children always carefully observe the ethical behaviors of their parents (who are the role models in the eyes of children) and they gain knowledge of different social facts about ethical behavior from their family first. In school, students should learn what is right and what is wrong. Teacher should impart value education to the pupils in regular classroom practice in an informal way (Gülcan, 2015).

To become a peaceful society as a whole, its constituent members must require protections from any sort of violence, injustice, dishonour and discrimination. It is well established fact about a child that he or she is not simply a materialistic creature but also a holistic living individual (National Council of Educational Research and Training, 2003).

The second most important factor in nurturing values is the family of a child that absolutely plays a decisive role in inculcating values in a child. That is the reason why a child growing with conflict in a home is improbable to have peace in their mind. It is always true that strong healthy relationships in a stable family create sound values and ethics in the mind of a child. Therefore, child's home is the nursery for inculcating values as well as ethics.
The community is the third building block of values and ethics in which an individual finds him or herself to exist. The fourth structural block for fostering ethics and values in a person is the society as a whole. According to many educationists, it is a fact that the society in its nature is an extended family which is mainly characterised by diversities of human beings, and also the welfare of families and communities.

Lastly, the entire country is the supreme or ultimate building block of ethics and values. It is of no doubt that if a nation that permits its people to be overtaken by hate and negative thoughts, then, certainly it lets their energies to be simply wasted (NCERT, 2011).

2.0 REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE:

According to Seshadri (1981), in India, the problem of moral as well as ethical education has not produced great attention as well as deep anxiety on the part of the thinkers from education sector and administrative domain on such a scale which can be comparable to what Western countries has done in this respect.

Boehnke, Dettenborn, Horstmann, and Schwartz (1994) stated that in the East Germany and the West Germany, moral values and ethics of the teacher as well as the students were seen as opposite to each other. The authors also mentioned that value education is delivered through the curricula of the schools in Germany.

According to Erasmus (2015), at the E.U level, there are as such no proper and explicit guidelines or strategies for value education in different schools. It is only Germany which has a dedicated subject of values and ethical education in school education curriculum.

Yadav and Saini (2016) stated that various changes such as privatization and globalization accompanied with many problems are the main reasons for declining ethics and values in Indian society. Thus there is an urgent need to introduce value oriented education

(specifically with human values) in the curriculum of school education to redesign the fabric of education system of the country.

3.0 OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

1. To study the values and ethics in secondary education of India and Germany.
2. To compare the values and ethics in secondary education between India and Germany.
3. To find out some important critical issues on values and ethics in secondary education of India for overall development of secondary school education of the country.

4.0 METHODOLOGY

This is a qualitative study. It adopted analytical method with logical approach since it aims to compare the values and ethics in secondary education between two countries- India and Germany. The data were collected through internet sources, different research reports, research papers and various official websites related to the secondary education of India and Germany. The data were analyzed critically with logical approach considering various factors related to the values and ethics in secondary education of India and Germany.

5.0 VALUES AND ETHICS IN SECONDARY EDUCATION OF INDIA

India has long rich cultural history of inculcating values and ethics in the society. Inner sense of its people of this country towards positivism in life and inherent quality values among them have certainly added strength to the artistic and cultural philosophy of the numerous communities belonging to several religions and beliefs in the entire country (Lakshimi, 2009).

The Need for Value and Ethical Education in modern India:

According to NCERT (2011), a largely vital rationale for re-orientation of education for imparting values and ethics in the school education of India is the fact that the existing form of education produces irregular improvement of the students. This prevailing model of education generally stresses extra spotlight on cognitive domain of the pupils but it neglects the affective domain of educational objectives. In this present era of extreme competition in every aspect of life, today's children are nurtured within the family in an environment of disproportionate competition among them and they are taught right from the beginning of

their life to struggle with this violent competition. As a result, original facts and holistic education are detached from contexts of their life. In this present educational context, the individualistic idea of excellence which emphasizes only on personal development is being promoted at the expense of emotional and relational abilities. It is of great concern that young pupils are not well known of the fact that how they should live in the environment surrounding them and how to commit themselves for the interests of the whole nation. They hardly know the fact how to think about the surroundings as well as other social and moral issues. The young people of this country have no vivid idea of what sort of human being they expect to become in future when they finally complete the education at the school level. This new extra-ordinary kind of education actually transforms the children into machines. This kind of standpoint generally destroys the holy purpose of education.

The recent revival of interest in delivering proper education which is considered as a powerful means to foster values among children is also due to the fact that there is a fast deterioration of ethics and values in the society of the country. Though our society has made substantial progress, but still, it is distressed by social conflicts, corruption and also by extreme violence. In the recent period, a distortion in the value system in our society is being observed. Majority of the individuals are only interested in their own families and are not fascinated in the development of the entire society. Even though, decay of values and ethics was being in existence right through the history of human being and it is collectively shared by all cultures in the world but in India, the current degradation of values has become a serious matter of great concern. Some typical instances of degradation of values and ethics in the present society of India are: people are becoming more selfish and greedy; honesty is disappearing from the society; violence is becoming the more frequent; corruption and abuse have turned out to be more familiar. Vandalism, drug abuse, stealing, cheating and also commercialization are witnessed more often than ever before. In this crucial context, parents, schools and public generally sense that the young people have lost qualities of courteousness, respect and responsibility. In this country, in fact, there is a public call for proper education and actions because of the degeneration of our cultural philosophy.

In India, approximately each policy on education has given emphasis to the responsibility of education system in promotion of values and ethics among the children. Kothari Commission (1964-66) suggested that moral along with spiritual values should be introduced in the school education curriculum. Necessity of education for values and ethics in this country was also recommended by the National Policy of Education (1986) to eradicate violence, intolerance, superstition from the society and to encourage cultural as well as

scientific principles for building India an ideally democratic, secular and also a progressive country getting pride in its rich cultural heritage. Values and ethics were also considered by the National Curriculum Framework for School Education (2000) which brought the spotlight on eradication of social as well as spiritual values and ethics. It recommended the amalgamation of ethics and values in the school curriculum in India.

Again, National Curriculum Framework, 2005 firmly advocated for nurturing specific values and ethics like reverence for human rights, co-operation, proper justice, tolerance, responsible as a citizen of the country, diversity, admiration to democracy and peaceful argument resolution. It also promoted 'education for peace' as an extremely important national as well as global topic. In this country, values and ethical education is not unique in recent times but the erosion of values and ethics has forced introspection and reflection in this present education system (Central Board of Secondary Education, 2012).

It was emphasized by the National Council of Educational Research and Training (NCERT) in India on development of ethics, fostering values, developing attitudes and skills required for existing harmoniously with each others. In India, Central Board of Secondary Education (CBSE) has recently commenced 'Life-Skills education' in those schools that are affiliated to this board, which upholds and nurture inculcation of values and ethics among the students (Ministry of Human Resource Development, GoI, 2019).

Approaches and Strategies for integration of values and ethics in secondary school education in India:

According to Central Board of Secondary Education (2003), the main objectives of value and ethical education in schools in India are-

- ❖ Holistic development of the child;
- ❖ Revisiting the concept values and ethics and making everyone aware of present degradation of values and ethics;
- ❖ Nurturing the perception of interdependence between a family, society, country and the whole world;
- ❖ To bring in a positive societal ethics;
- ❖ Upgrading of the excellence of education;
- ❖ To bring peace as well as harmony in oneself.

It has been a common view that values and ethics are generally acquired and are best inculcated through experiences. But, these certain experiences must to be consistent and

inherent to the personal as well as social environment of the particular pupil. That is why, wherever possible, NCERT has included such serious concerns in the textbooks for different stages of school education. Considering the recent context of education in India, NCERT has also brought out values and ethical education framework which precisely provides guidelines to all the schools in this country to categorize their own priorities of values and accordingly to sketch their actions. An important resource book for all the teachers of India has also been developed by National Council of Educational Research and Training and it is entitled as 'Ways to Peace'. According to NCF (2005), the development of self-esteem and ethics, must receive primacy in formulating the guiding principle of curriculum development. NCERT recommended to insert 'Peace Education' in the curriculum at the secondary and higher secondary stage in India in NCF (2005). According to NCERT, education for peace aims for fostering development of ethics, cultivating the proper values and attitudes especially obligatory for living in harmony within the nature. This subject (Peace education) incorporates the natural joy of living of human being and also the development of personality with the qualities of love. To teach this special topic, all the concerned teachers should deliberately try to instill and reinforce the significance of values related peace that is appropriate with the textual content taught in school and also the stages development of children (National Council of Educational Research and Training, 2005).

On the other hand, CBSE has effectively developed 'Values Education Manual and Values Education Kit' for the students of classes I-XII. This central board has also developed important manual for all the teachers on adolescent and environmental education that facilitates to inculcate values in children. CBSE also normally set up different programmes for building capacity in Values Education for all the teachers related to its affiliated schools (Ministry of Human Resource Development, GoI, 2019).

According to NCERT (2011), there is a general acceptance that education must provide the thrust of nurturing values and ethics. However, it is not evident how this is to be achieved in schools. Some schools or organizations have a preference to keep values and ethics as a separate subject while others believe that value education to be integrated with regular school activities. In India, while, education about religions, yoga and meditation are stressed by some school authorities, other schools mainly emphasize on inculcating democratic and national values among the students. Views are also different in terms of aims and objectives of value and ethical education in school and how it is to be delivered. In

majority of schools in India, values and ethics do not find deliberate focus in the school system. The main centre of attention of the schools is only to provide knowledge, while knowledge itself is not separated from values and ethics. On the other hand, in some of the schools of the country, separate time slot is specified on all the working days in a week to stress values and ethical education a special focal point. So, for the schools which emphasize on delivering value and ethical education, the basic assumption is that value education as well as ethical education is one of the important components of the entire curriculum of the school, and certainly this deserves some special attention. In this approach of the schools on delivering value and ethical education in school, there exist certain textbooks (class wise), teacher's working material with effective lesson plans for teaching of values and ethics in the school curriculum. The teachers employ different methods and techniques for delivering value and ethical education. Generally, in those schools, formal evaluation is an important part of this approach on value education.

In schools, ethics and values are best inculcated through practical and participatory modes of teaching-learning. To instil values and ethics in students, several empirical and reflective strategies that can be effectively used and properly integrated with the entire curriculum and activities in schools and they are -

- Value explanation
- Role playing and stories telling
- Presenting biographies of great personalities
- Anecdotes
- Group singing
- Group activities
- Discussion with questioning
- Silent sitting

6.0 VALUES AND ETHICS IN SECONDARY EDUCATION OF GERMANY

After the end of Second World War, in Germany, there was evolving an important question in the society and it was if at all, what sort of ethical essence were existed after the end of extreme fascism in the country and the corresponding degradation of the values of humanism and the ideals of high culture? In that significant zero-point circumstance, the first trend took an important direction in the after-war environment of Germany's society. At that very time, the great effort of survival was first aimed by building-up the cities, towns and

destroyed industries. The first priority of the German society was paid to the focus on materialistic values, assisted by the rapid re-establishment of previous political groups and economical structures. After the Second World War, the largely materialistic orientation of the entire society strongly influenced the schooling as a whole with a desire of the parents that their children might probably pass through secondary schools to achieve higher positions in social community.

During the seventies and eighties in Germany, in the environment of the restrictive politics, powerful efforts were carried out to call for the old moral values and virtues of citizenship of the country. During this time, the proclaimed values and ethics were to confirm and re-install the older virtues of the society such as diligence, discipline and also subordination (Kümmel, 1995).

Importance of value and ethical education in Germany:

Like in all other European countries, Germany's culture and moral values has also been evolved through many significant changes in the society. In these present days, in Germany's society, there are many problems related to inequalities in several dimensions, fluctuation of harmony and tolerance among the people of the society. In Germany, modern children actually need a different type of social environment, which contemporary society is no longer able to provide. They actually need to sort out all things in only good or bad, i.e. they prefer to have distinct alternatives and definite orientations (Kümmel, 1995).

According to Kopp, Niedermeier, and Mandl (2014), main aims and objectives of value and ethical education in Germany are to improve the quality of social life in the ways of-

- ❖ Maintaining democracy
- ❖ Providing justice
- ❖ To retain tolerance
- ❖ To instill harmony in the entire society

These aims and objectives of value and ethical education in Germany are in accordance with the Basic Laws of Germany in which democratic, well-justified, tolerant and solidary life is guaranteed to the people of the country. In Germany, pertaining to the value oriented education, there is a particular German constitutional standing. The article 7 of the constitution of the country regards religious education (which is a form of imparting moral

values and ethics to the students) as an essential subject for all the school students with the restriction that a pupil does not have to take part if his or her parent refuses.

In Germany, value and ethical education is socially, politically, scientifically, and also educationally of immense significance. It highlights the lively participation of the people with their environment and it also encourages diverse values in the society which are usually arises through experiencing and reflections of different political and social issues (Multrus, 2008).

Approaches and Strategies for inculcating values and ethics in secondary school education in Germany:

Moral education in Germany in public schools has generally stricter conditions and higher-leveled criteria. All schools in Germany necessarily are involved in delivering value and ethical education. The teachers in the schools always continuously and unavoidably try to impart moral education to the children about different rules and regulations of the school as well as values and ethics about the behavior of the pupils toward one another. It is also observed that at the school level (primary or secondary), several ethical arguments and values such as readiness to help others, multi-culturality, social tolerance, and friendship are emphasized in different educational approaches as well as in many institutional settings (Kümmel, 1995).

In Germany, it is defined in the education acts of all federal states of the country that democracy, tolerance and participation of the people should be inculcated in the society. These shape a general frame, which decides actions regarding schools and curriculum of the school education of the country. In Germany, teaching common values is essentially connected with the subject of citizenship education. The past history of citizenship education in the country is further strongly associated to the practice of the totalitarian rule in the early existence of its democracy. In Germany, there is also civic education which was introduced in between 1950s and 1960s as a separate school subject in Western Germany. Through this civic education moral values and ethics are being imparted to the students (European Parliament. (2017).

To create an appropriate and effective curriculum for fostering moral values and ethics in students, Germany has emphasized on the following aspects of moral values (Kümmel, 1995)-

❖ Proper reasoning about the justification of moral validity and obligation

- ❖ Motivating for social responsibilities and social engagement
- ❖ Insightful learning of what is good
- ❖ Critical reflections of the contemporary political and social practice

In Germany, Religious instruction, as an element of the regular curriculum of school education is an essential component of moral and ethical education in Germany. It is inherent to the present education system's mandate. It reaffirms the religious freedom of the German students at the same time respecting the social pluralism of the country. In this educational system, children and adolescents are placed in a situation to freely and independently choose their religious orientation.

At the primary, lower and upper secondary level, religious education of the catholic and protestant church is a mandatory subject in all public schools (primary or secondary) in Germany. In delivering religious education, there is a problem that many students in different states are non-Christians. So the governments of the different states are forced to institutionalize an alternative for religious education, which is officially named as values and ethics. They (values and ethics) are about the significance of life and destination of human beings as well as the place of an individual in society. In Germany, education about ethics and values in the curriculum is subjects of lessons in the primary schools and is also a conventional part of the studies in philosophy in secondary schools. Different types of values and ethical education (for example social morals, Aristotelian philosophy, ethics of Kantian reason and Humean tolerance, moral values of emotion) are there in the curriculum (Kümmel, 1995).

In this country (Germany), the condition concerning ethical and value education in fact differs with dissimilar regions i.e. it differs state to state. For example, in the state of Berlin, it is generally opined that state-imposed instruction in philosophical or religious issues does not conform completely to the fundamental principles of a free and democratic society. In this special state, young pupils are bound to join school classes of ethics without having the option of confessionally-oriented religious lessons provided by the different churches or other philosophically-minded communities (Vetter, 2008).

In general, in all most all states, there are a number of ethics related subjects such as General Ethics, Ethical Education, Philosophy, Value and Norms, Religious education etc., that are mandatory or compulsory-electives for the grades 1 to 12 of primary along with secondary schools in Germany. The main substances of those subjects or topics mainly focus

on accountable and norm-oriented behavior. These subjects also discuss a wide range of values and ethics (for example-democracy, social tolerance, religions, justice, harmony, peace dignity, community, nature, fraternity, critical thinking and many others). By and large, the German school educational system generally calls for a special training for the school teachers to deliver education related to values and ethics in the classes. Those teachers in the schools who want to teach ethical education, are required a unique professional expertise. Teachers can acquire this professional expertise at a university having the major subjects in ethics or philosophy or values and norms. Furthermore, the federal states of Germany can qualify school teachers within these value-oriented subjects in the course of highly developed educational trainings as well, though there may be regional differences (Erasmus, 2015).

There are some general teaching-learning methods in the country to instill values and ethics among the students and they are-

- Creative learning;
- Self-organized learning
- Collaborative activities;
- Experimental activities.

7.0 COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

Summarizing the above discussion, it can be stated that there exist some significant differences and also a commonality in values and ethics in secondary education between India and Germany.

In Germany, there are special German constitutional laws regarding the implementation of values and ethics in school education curriculum. German constitution considers the religious education (a form of imparting values and ethics to the students) as an obligatory subject for all school students. On the other hand, in India there is no such constitutional obligation regarding values and ethics in school education curriculum. Certainly, values and ethical aspects like fraternity, equality, sovereignty, and justice are there in the Indian constitution for all its people to follow. But still there is no such rule in India that every school is bound to incorporate values and ethics in the school education curriculum. Recently NCERT recommended to include values and ethical education in Indian school curriculum. But this is not mandatory. Still there are many states in India where value education is not incorporated in the school equation curriculum.

Another significant difference between India and Germany is that religious education (one way to deliver instruction about values and ethics) is compulsory subject in upper secondary curriculum in Germany, but in India, there is no such religious education in any board except the Madrassas. In India, some boards of secondary education implemented Life-Skills education (like CBSE) or Peace Education in the curriculum to impart values and ethical education to the students.

There is another significant difference in respects of how much importance the country is giving in implementation of value and ethical education in the school education. In India there is a general acceptance that education must provide the thrust of nurturing values and ethics. Many committees and commissions on education of India and many organisation of this country repeated surged voices time to time about value and ethical education in schools but implementations of these recommendations are still not be done properly in Indian school education. On the other side, Germany stress great importance on delivering values and ethical education to the students in schools incorporating subjects such as Ethics, Ethical Education, General Ethics, Philosophy; Value and Norms, religious education etc. in the curriculum which are compulsory or compulsory-electives in grade 1 to 12 from primary to upper secondary level.

In Germany, a special training or special professional expertise for teachers who want to teach values and ethical education in the classes is needed in most of the school educational systems of different states of the country. But in India, there is no such special training or professional development programme for the teachers.

One similarity has been observed on value and ethical education at the secondary level between India and Germany. In both countries, value education and ethical education are being imparted to the secondary school students at present time and the overall objectives of the value and ethical education in these two countries are almost the similar. Both the countries intend to instill values and ethics in students for maintaining democracy, tolerance and peace and justice in the society.

8.0 EDUCATIONAL IMPLICATIONS OF THE STUDY:

It has been undoubtedly observed from the above discussion that in Germany there are special constitutional laws related to the effective implementation of values and ethical education in school education curriculum. On the other side, in India there is no such

constitutional obligation related to values and ethical education in school curriculum. So in this context, India also can adopt values and ethical education in the school curriculum as a constitutional obligation for enhancement of harmonious and quality development of the country's entire education system for all its states.

9.0 CONCLUSION:

From the previous discussion it can stated that Germany stresses more on values and ethical education in secondary school education than India. Though many committees and commissions on education of this country have repeated advocated for value and ethical education in schools but still now value and ethical education is not made compulsory at the secondary level of education of the country. So the government of India should take urgent steps to implement value and ethical education in school education curriculum keeping in view of the importance of value education in the present context social-economic scenario of the entire country.

REFERENCES

1. Boehnke, K., Dettenborn, H., Horstmann, K., & Schwartz, S. (1994). Value Priorities in the United Germany: Teachers and Students from East and West Compared. *European Journal of Psychology of Education, 9*(3), 191-202. Retrieved March 10, 2020, from www.jstor.org/stable/23420245

2. Central Board of Secondary Education. (2003). *Value Education, A Handbook for Teachers.* New Delhi :CBSE

3. Central Board of Secondary Education. (2012). *Value Education, A Handbook for Teachers.* New Delhi: CBSE

4. Erasmus. (2015). *Ethics and Values Education: Existing State of the Art and User Needs Analysis.* Retrieved March 9, 2020 from http://www.ethics-education.eu/resources/Ethika_State%20of%20the%20Art%20and%20Needs%20Analysis.pdf

5. European Parliament. (2017). *Research for CULT Committee - Teaching Common Values in Europe.* Retrieved May 5, 2020 from https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2017/585918/IPOL_STU(2017)585918_EN.pdf

6. Gülcan, N.Y. (2015). Discussing the importance of teaching ethics in education. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, 174*, 2622 – 2625. doi: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.942

7. Kopp, B., Niedermeier, S., & Mandl, H. (2014, 17th-19th November). *Actual Practical Value Education in Germany.* Paper presented at ICERI2014 Conference, Seville, Spain. Retrieved March 31, 2020 from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/301558535

8. Kümmel, F. (1995). *Moral Education in Germany.* Paper presented at the 2nd International Conference on Moral Education, Institute of Moalogy, Kashiwa-shi , Japan. Retrieved March 9, 2020 from http://www.friedrich-kuemmel.de/doc/MoralEducation.pdf

9. Lakshimi, C. (2009). Value Education: An Indian Perspective on the Need for Moral Education in a Time of Rapid Social Change. *Journal of College and Character, 10*(3). DOI:10.2202/1940-1639.1077

10. Ministry of Human Resource Development, GoI. (2019). *Promoting value education at schools across the country*. Retrieved March 30, 2020 from https://pib.gov.in/Pressreleaseshare.aspx?PRID=1578391

11. Multrus, U. (2008). Werteerziehung in der Schule – Ein Überblick über aktuelle Konzepte. In Bayerischen Staatsministerium für Unterricht und Kultus (Ed.), *Werte machen stark. Praxishandbuch zur Werteerziehung*. Augsburg, Germany: Brigg Pädagogik.

12. National Council of Educational Research and Training. (2003). *Values Education in Indian Schools: Experiences and Strategies of Implementation*. New Delhi, India : NCERT

13. NCERT. (2005). *National Curriculum Rramework, 2005*. Retrieved March 30, 2020 from www.ncert.nic.in

14. NCERT. (2011). *Education for Values in Schools – A Framework*. New Delhi, India: NCERT

15. Seshadri, C. (1981). The Concept of Moral Education: Indian and Western-A Comparative Study. *Comparative Education, 17*(3), 293-310. Retrieved March 10, 2020, from www.jstor.org/stable/3098686

16. Strahovnik, V. (2016). Ethics and Values Education. In: Peters M. (eds), *Encyclopedia of Educational Philosophy and Theory*. Singapore: Springer

17. Surbhi, S. (2017). *Difference Between Ethics and Values*. Retrieved March 30, 2020 from https://keydifferences.com/difference-between-ethics-and-values.html

18. Vetter, C. (2008). *Religious instruction is a vital component of moral education*. Retrieved May 5, 2020 from www.ekd.de

19. Yadav, U., & Saini, M. (2016). Ethical Moral values & Indian Education System. Retrieved March 8, 2020 from http://www.internationalseminar.org/XVII_AIS/TS5A_PDF/7.Urmila%20Yadav.pdf